

# The Mason–Stothers theorem

Manuel Eberl

October 13, 2025

## Abstract

This article provides a formalisation of Snyder’s simple and elegant proof of the Mason–Stothers theorem [2, 1], which is the polynomial analogue of the famous *abc* Conjecture for integers. Remarkably, Snyder found this very elegant proof when he was still a high-school student.

In short, the statement of the theorem is that three non-zero coprime polynomials  $A$ ,  $B$ ,  $C$  over a field which sum to 0 and do not all have vanishing derivatives fulfil  $\max\{\deg(A), \deg(B), \deg(C)\} < \deg(\text{rad}(ABC))$  where  $\text{rad}(P)$  denotes the *radical* of  $P$ , i. e. the product of all unique irreducible factors of  $P$ .

This theorem also implies a kind of polynomial analogue of Fermat’s Last Theorem for polynomials: except for trivial cases,  $A^n + B^n + C^n = 0$  implies  $n \leq 2$  for coprime polynomials  $A$ ,  $B$ ,  $C$  over a field.

## Contents

<b>1</b>	<b>The Mason–Stother’s Theorem</b>	<b>2</b>
1.1	Auxiliary material . . . . .	2
1.2	Definition of a radical . . . . .	2
1.3	Main result . . . . .	4

# 1 The Mason–Stother’s Theorem

**theory** *Mason-Stothers*

**imports**

*HOL-Computational-Algebra.Computational-Algebra*

*HOL-Computational-Algebra.Polynomial-Factorial*

**begin**

## 1.1 Auxiliary material

**hide-const** (**open**) *Formal-Power-Series.radical*

**lemma** *degree-div:*

**assumes**  $a \text{ dvd } b$

**shows**  $\text{degree } (b \text{ div } a) = \text{degree } b - \text{degree } a$

**using** *assms* **by** (*cases*  $a = 0$ ; *cases*  $b = 0$ ) (*auto elim!:* *dvdE simp: degree-mult-eq*)

**lemma** *degree-pderiv-le:*

**shows**  $\text{degree } (\text{pderiv } p) \leq \text{degree } p - 1$

**by** (*rule degree-le, cases degree*  $p = 0$ ) (*auto simp: coeff-pderiv coeff-eq-0*)

**lemma** *degree-pderiv-less:*

**assumes**  $\text{pderiv } p \neq 0$

**shows**  $\text{degree } (\text{pderiv } p) < \text{degree } p$

**proof** –

**have**  $\text{degree } (\text{pderiv } p) \leq \text{degree } p - 1$

**by** (*rule degree-pderiv-le*)

**also have**  $\text{degree } p \neq 0$

**using** *assms* **by** (*auto intro!:* *Nat.gr0I elim!:* *degree-eq-zeroE*)

**hence**  $\text{degree } p - 1 < \text{degree } p$  **by** *simp*

**finally show** *?thesis* .

**qed**

**lemma** *pderiv-eq-0:*

**assumes**  $\text{degree } p = 0$

**shows**  $\text{pderiv } p = 0$

**using** *assms* **by** (*auto elim!:* *degree-eq-zeroE*)

## 1.2 Definition of a radical

The following definition of a radical is generic for any factorial semiring.

**context** *factorial-semiring*

**begin**

**definition** *radical* ::  $'a \Rightarrow 'a$  **where**

$\text{radical } x = (\text{if } x = 0 \text{ then } 0 \text{ else } \prod (\text{prime-factors } x))$

**lemma** *radical-0 [simp]: radical 0 = 0*

**by** (*simp add: radical-def*)

**lemma** *radical-nonzero*:  $x \neq 0 \implies \text{radical } x = \prod (\text{prime-factors } x)$   
**by** (*simp add: radical-def*)

**lemma** *radical-eq-0-iff* [*simp*]:  $\text{radical } x = 0 \iff x = 0$   
**by** (*auto simp: radical-def*)

**lemma** *prime-factorization-radical* [*simp*]:  
**assumes**  $x \neq 0$   
**shows**  $\text{prime-factorization } (\text{radical } x) = \text{mset-set } (\text{prime-factors } x)$   
**proof** –  
**have**  $\text{prime-factorization } (\text{radical } x) = (\sum p \in \text{prime-factors } x. \text{prime-factorization } p)$   
**unfolding** *radical-def* **using** *assms* **by** (*auto intro!: prime-factorization-prod*)  
**also have**  $\dots = (\sum p \in \text{prime-factors } x. \{\#p\# \})$   
**by** (*intro Groups-Big.sum.cong*) (*auto intro!: prime-factorization-prime*)  
**also have**  $\dots = \text{mset-set } (\text{prime-factors } x)$  **by** *simp*  
**finally show** ?thesis .  
**qed**

**lemma** *prime-factors-radical* [*simp*]:  $x \neq 0 \implies \text{prime-factors } (\text{radical } x) = \text{prime-factors } x$   
**by** *simp*

**lemma** *radical-dvd* [*simp, intro*]:  $\text{radical } x \text{ dvd } x$   
**by** (*cases x = 0*) (*force intro: prime-factorization-subset-imp-dvd mset-set-set-mset-msubset*) +

**lemma** *multiplicity-radical-prime*:  
**assumes**  $\text{prime } p \ x \neq 0$   
**shows**  $\text{multiplicity } p (\text{radical } x) = (\text{if } p \text{ dvd } x \text{ then } 1 \text{ else } 0)$   
**proof** –  
**have**  $\text{multiplicity } p (\text{radical } x) = (\sum q \in \text{prime-factors } x. \text{multiplicity } p \ q)$   
**using** *assms* **unfolding** *radical-def*  
**by** (*auto simp: prime-elem-multiplicity-prod-distrib*)  
**also have**  $\dots = (\sum q \in \text{prime-factors } x. \text{if } p = q \text{ then } 1 \text{ else } 0)$   
**using** *assms* **by** (*intro Groups-Big.sum.cong*) (*auto intro!: prime-multiplicity-other*)  
**also have**  $\dots = (\text{if } p \in \text{prime-factors } x \text{ then } 1 \text{ else } 0)$  **by** *simp*  
**also have**  $\dots = (\text{if } p \text{ dvd } x \text{ then } 1 \text{ else } 0)$   
**using** *assms* **by** (*auto simp: prime-factors-dvd*)  
**finally show** ?thesis .  
**qed**

**lemma** *radical-1* [*simp*]:  $\text{radical } 1 = 1$   
**by** (*simp add: radical-def*)

**lemma** *radical-unit* [*simp*]:  $\text{is-unit } x \implies \text{radical } x = 1$   
**by** (*auto simp: radical-def prime-factorization-unit*)

**lemma** *prime-factors-power*:

```

assumes  $n > 0$ 
shows  $\text{prime-factors } (x \wedge n) = \text{prime-factors } x$ 
using assms by (cases  $x = 0$ ) (auto simp: prime-factors-dvd zero-power prime-dvd-power-iff)

lemma radical-power [simp]:  $n > 0 \implies \text{radical } (x \wedge n) = \text{radical } x$ 
  by (auto simp add: radical-def prime-factors-power)

end

context factorial-semiring-gcd
begin

lemma radical-mult-coprime:
  assumes coprime  $a\ b$ 
  shows  $\text{radical } (a * b) = \text{radical } a * \text{radical } b$ 
proof (cases  $a = 0 \vee b = 0$ )
  case False
    with assms have  $\text{prime-factors } a \cap \text{prime-factors } b = \{\}$ 
    using not-prime-unit coprime-common-divisor by (auto simp: prime-factors-dvd)
    hence  $\prod (\text{prime-factors } a \cup \text{prime-factors } b) = \prod (\text{prime-factors } a) * \prod (\text{prime-factors } b)$ 
    by (intro prod.union-disjoint) auto
    with False show ?thesis by (simp add: radical-def prime-factorization-mult)
  qed auto

lemma multiplicity-le-imp-dvd':
  assumes  $x \neq 0 \wedge p. p \in \text{prime-factors } x \implies \text{multiplicity } p\ x \leq \text{multiplicity } p\ y$ 
  shows  $x \text{ dvd } y$ 
proof (rule multiplicity-le-imp-dvd)
  fix  $p$  assume prime  $p$ 
  thus  $\text{multiplicity } p\ x \leq \text{multiplicity } p\ y$  using assms(1) assms(2)[of  $p$ ]
  by (cases  $p \text{ dvd } x$ ) (auto simp: prime-factors-dvd not-dvd-imp-multiplicity-0)
qed fact+

end

```

### 1.3 Main result

The following proofs are basically a one-to-one translation of Franz Lemmermeyer's presentation [1] of Snyder's proof of the Mason–Stothers theorem.

```

lemma prime-power-dvd-pderiv:
  fixes  $f\ p :: 'a :: \text{field-gcd poly}$ 
  assumes prime-elem  $p$ 
  defines  $n \equiv \text{multiplicity } p\ f - 1$ 
  shows  $p \wedge n \text{ dvd } \text{pderiv } f$ 
proof (cases  $p \text{ dvd } f \wedge f \neq 0$ )
  case True
    hence  $\text{multiplicity } p\ f > 0$  using assms
    by (subst prime-multiplicity-gt-zero-iff) auto

```

```

hence Suc-n: Suc n = multiplicity p f by (simp add: n-def)
define g where g = f div p ^ Suc n
have p ^ Suc n dvd f unfolding Suc-n by (rule multiplicity-dvd)
hence f-eq: f = p ^ Suc n * g by (simp add: g-def)
also have pderiv ... = p ^ n * (smult (of-nat (Suc n)) (pderiv p * g) + p *
pderiv g)
  by (simp only: pderiv-mult pderiv-power-Suc) (simp add: algebra-simps)
also have p ^ n dvd ... by simp
finally show ?thesis .
qed (auto simp: n-def not-dvd-imp-multiplicity-0)

lemma poly-div-radical-dvd-pderiv:
  fixes p :: 'a :: field-gcd poly
  shows p div radical p dvd pderiv p
proof (cases pderiv p = 0)
  case False
  hence p ≠ 0 by auto
  show ?thesis
  proof (rule multiplicity-le-imp-dvd')
    fix q :: 'a poly assume q: q ∈ prime-factors (p div radical p)
    hence q dvd p div radical p by auto
    also from ⟨p ≠ 0⟩ have ... dvd p by (subst div-dvd-iff-mult) auto
    finally have q dvd p .

    have p = p div radical p * radical p by simp
    also from q and ⟨p ≠ 0⟩ have multiplicity q ... = Suc (multiplicity q (p div
radical p))
      by (subst prime-elem-multiplicity-mult-distrib)
      (auto simp: dvd-div-eq-0-iff multiplicity-radical-prime ⟨q dvd p⟩ prime-factors-dvd)
    finally have multiplicity q (p div radical p) ≤ multiplicity q p - 1 by simp
    also have ... ≤ multiplicity q (pderiv p) using ⟨pderiv p ≠ 0⟩ and q and ⟨p
≠ 0⟩
      by (intro multiplicity-geI prime-power-dvd-pderiv)
      (auto simp: prime-factors-dvd dvd-div-eq-0-iff)
    finally show multiplicity q (p div radical p) ≤ multiplicity q (pderiv p) .
  qed (insert ⟨p ≠ 0⟩, auto simp: dvd-div-eq-0-iff)
qed auto

lemma degree-pderiv-mult-less:
  assumes pderiv C ≠ 0
  shows degree (pderiv C * B) < degree B + degree C
proof -
  have degree (pderiv C * B) ≤ degree (pderiv C) + degree B
    by (rule degree-mult-le)
  also from assms have degree (pderiv C) < degree C by (rule degree-pderiv-less)
  finally show ?thesis by simp
qed

lemma Mason-Stothers-aux:

```

```

fixes A B C :: 'a :: field-gcd poly
assumes nz: A ≠ 0 B ≠ 0 C ≠ 0 and sum: A + B + C = 0 and coprime: Gcd
{A, B, C} = 1
and deg-ge: degree A ≥ degree (radical (A * B * C))
shows pderiv A = 0 pderiv B = 0 pderiv C = 0
proof -
have C-eq: C = -A - B - C = A + B using sum by algebra+
from coprime have gcd A (gcd B (-C)) = 1 by simp
also note C-eq(2)
finally have coprime A B by (simp add: gcd.commute add.commute[of A B]
coprime-iff-gcd-eq-1)
hence coprime A (-C) coprime B (-C)
unfolding C-eq by (simp-all add: gcd.commute[of B A] gcd.commute[of B A
+ B]
add.commute coprime-iff-gcd-eq-1)
hence coprime A C coprime B C by simp-all
note coprime = coprime ⟨coprime A B⟩ this
have coprime1: coprime (A div radical A) (B div radical B)
by (rule coprime-divisors[OF - - ⟨coprime A B⟩]) (insert nz, auto simp: div-dvd-iff-mult)
have coprime2: coprime (A div radical A) (C div radical C)
by (rule coprime-divisors[OF - - ⟨coprime A C⟩]) (insert nz, auto simp:
div-dvd-iff-mult)
have coprime3: coprime (B div radical B) (C div radical C)
by (rule coprime-divisors[OF - - ⟨coprime B C⟩]) (insert nz, auto simp:
div-dvd-iff-mult)
have coprime4: coprime (A div radical A * (B div radical B)) (C div radical C)
using coprime2 coprime3 by (subst coprime-mult-left-iff) auto

have eq: A * pderiv B - pderiv A * B = pderiv C * B - C * pderiv B
by (simp add: C-eq pderiv-add pderiv-diff pderiv-minus algebra-simps)

have A div radical A dvd (A * pderiv B - pderiv A * B)
using nz by (intro dvd-diff dvd-mult2 poly-div-radical-dvd-pderiv) (auto simp:
div-dvd-iff-mult)
with eq have A div radical A dvd (pderiv C * B - C * pderiv B) by simp
moreover have C div radical C dvd (pderiv C * B - C * pderiv B)
using nz by (intro dvd-diff dvd-mult2 poly-div-radical-dvd-pderiv) (auto simp:
div-dvd-iff-mult)
moreover have B div radical B dvd (pderiv C * B - C * pderiv B)
using nz by (intro dvd-diff dvd-mult2 poly-div-radical-dvd-pderiv) (auto simp:
div-dvd-iff-mult)
ultimately have (A div radical A) * (B div radical B) * (C div radical C) dvd
(pderiv C * B - C * pderiv B) using coprime coprime1 coprime4
by (intro divides-mult) auto
also have (A div radical A) * (B div radical B) * (C div radical C) =
(A * B * C) div (radical A * radical B * radical C)
by (simp add: div-mult-div-if-dvd mult-dvd-mono)
also have radical A * radical B * radical C = radical (A * B) * radical C
using coprime by (subst radical-mult-coprime) auto

```

**also have**  $\dots = \text{radical } (A * B * C)$   
**using** *coprime* **by** (*subst radical-mult-coprime [symmetric]*) *auto*  
**finally have** *dvd*:  $((A * B * C) \text{ div } \text{radical } (A * B * C)) \text{ dvd } (pderiv C * B - C * pderiv B)$  .

**have**  $pderiv B = 0 \wedge pderiv C = 0$   
**proof** (*rule ccontr*)  
**assume**  $\neg(pderiv B = 0 \wedge pderiv C = 0)$   
**hence** \*:  $pderiv B \neq 0 \vee pderiv C \neq 0$  **by** *blast*

**have**  $\text{degree } (pderiv C * B - C * pderiv B) \leq$   
 $\text{max } (\text{degree } (pderiv C * B)) (\text{degree } (C * pderiv B))$  **by** (*rule degree-diff-le-max*)  
**also have**  $\dots < \text{degree } B + \text{degree } C$   
**using** *degree-pderiv-mult-less[of B C]* *degree-pderiv-mult-less[of C B]* \*  
**by** (*cases pderiv B = 0*; *cases pderiv C = 0*) (*auto simp add: algebra-simps*)  
**also have**  $\text{degree } B + \text{degree } C = \text{degree } (B * C)$   
**using** *nz* **by** (*subst degree-mult-eq*) *auto*  
**also have**  $\dots = \text{degree } (A * (B * C)) - \text{degree } A$   
**using** *nz* **by** (*subst (2) degree-mult-eq*) *auto*  
**also have**  $\dots \leq \text{degree } (A * B * C) - \text{degree } (\text{radical } (A * B * C))$  **unfolding** *mult.assoc*  
**using** *assms* **by** (*intro diff-le-mono2*) (*auto simp: mult-ac*)  
**also have**  $\dots = \text{degree } ((A * B * C) \text{ div } \text{radical } (A * B * C))$   
**by** (*intro degree-div [symmetric]*) *auto*  
**finally have** *less*:  $\text{degree } (pderiv C * B - C * pderiv B) <$   
 $\text{degree } (A * B * C \text{ div } \text{radical } (A * B * C))$  **by** *simp*

**have** *eq'*:  $pderiv C * B - C * pderiv B = 0$   
**proof** (*rule ccontr*)  
**assume**  $pderiv C * B - C * pderiv B \neq 0$   
**hence**  $\text{degree } (A * B * C \text{ div } \text{radical } (A * B * C)) \leq \text{degree } (pderiv C * B - C * pderiv B)$   
**using** *dvd* **by** (*intro dvd-imp-degree-le*) *auto*  
**with less** **show** *False* **by** *linarith*

**qed**  
**from** \* **show** *False*  
**proof** (*elim disjE*)  
**assume** [*simp*]:  $pderiv C \neq 0$   
**have** *C dvd C \* pderiv B* **by** *simp*  
**also from** *eq'* **have**  $\dots = pderiv C * B$  **by** *simp*  
**finally have** *C dvd pderiv C* **using** *coprime*  
**by** (*subst (asm) coprime-dvd-mult-left-iff*) (*auto simp: coprime-commute*)  
**hence**  $\text{degree } C \leq \text{degree } (pderiv C)$  **by** (*intro dvd-imp-degree-le*) *auto*  
**moreover have**  $\text{degree } (pderiv C) < \text{degree } C$  **by** (*intro degree-pderiv-less*) *auto*  
**ultimately show** *False* **by** *simp*

**next**  
**assume** [*simp*]:  $pderiv B \neq 0$

```

have B dvd B * pderiv C by simp
also from eq' have ... = pderiv B * C by (simp add: mult-ac)
finally have B dvd pderiv B using coprime
  by (subst (asm) coprime-dvd-mult-left-iff) auto
hence degree B ≤ degree (pderiv B) by (intro dvd-imp-degree-le) auto
moreover have degree (pderiv B) < degree B by (intro degree-pderiv-less)
auto
ultimately show False by simp
qed
qed
with eq and nz show pderiv A = 0 pderiv B = 0 pderiv C = 0 by auto
qed

theorem Mason-Stothers:
  fixes A B C :: 'a :: field-gcd poly
  assumes nz: A ≠ 0 B ≠ 0 C ≠ 0 ∃ p ∈ {A, B, C}. pderiv p ≠ 0
    and sum: A + B + C = 0 and coprime: Gcd {A, B, C} = 1
  shows Max {degree A, degree B, degree C} < degree (radical (A * B * C))
proof -
  have degree A < degree (radical (A * B * C))
  if ∃ p ∈ {A, B, C}. p ≠ 0 ∃ p ∈ {A, B, C}. pderiv p ≠ 0 sum-mset {#A, B, C#} =
0 Gcd {A, B, C} = 1
  for A B C :: 'a poly
proof (rule ccontr)
  assume ¬(degree A < degree (radical (A * B * C)))
  hence degree A ≥ degree (radical (A * B * C)) by simp
  with Mason-Stothers-aux[of A B C] that show False by (auto simp: add-ac)
qed
from this[of A B C] this[of B C A] this[of C A B] assms show ?thesis
by (simp only: insert-commute mult-ac add-ac) (auto simp: add-ac mult-ac)
qed

```

The result can be simplified a bit more in fields of characteristic 0:

```

corollary Mason-Stothers-char-0:
  fixes A B C :: 'a :: {field-gcd, field-char-0} poly
  assumes nz: A ≠ 0 B ≠ 0 C ≠ 0 and deg: ∃ p ∈ {A, B, C}. degree p ≠ 0
    and sum: A + B + C = 0 and coprime: Gcd {A, B, C} = 1
  shows Max {degree A, degree B, degree C} < degree (radical (A * B * C))
proof -
  from deg have ∃ p ∈ {A, B, C}. pderiv p ≠ 0
  by (auto simp: pderiv-eq-0-iff)
  from Mason-Stothers[OF assms(1-3) this assms(5-)] show ?thesis .
qed

```

As a nice corollary, we get a kind of analogue of Fermat's last theorem for polynomials: Given non-zero polynomials  $A$ ,  $B$ ,  $C$  with  $A^n + B^n + C^n = 0$  on lowest terms, we must either have  $n \leq 2$  or  $(A^n)' = (B^n)' = (C^n)' = 0$ .

In the case of a field with characteristic 0, this last possibility is equivalent to  $A$ ,  $B$ , and  $C$  all being constant.



**corollary** *fermat-poly*:

**fixes**  $A\ B\ C :: 'a :: \text{field-gcd poly}$   
**assumes**  $\text{sum}: A^n + B^n + C^n = 0$  **and**  $\text{cop}: \text{Gcd}\{A, B, C\} = 1$   
**assumes**  $\text{nz}: A \neq 0\ B \neq 0\ C \neq 0$  **and**  $\text{deg}: \exists p \in \{A, B, C\}. \text{pderiv}(p^n) \neq 0$   
**shows**  $n \leq 2$   
**proof** (*rule ccontr*)  
**assume**  $\neg(n \leq 2)$   
**hence**  $n > 2$  **by** *simp*  
**have**  $\text{Max}\{\text{degree}(A^n), \text{degree}(B^n), \text{degree}(C^n)\} <$   
 $\text{degree}(\text{radical}(A^n * B^n * C^n))$  (**is**  $- < ?d$ )  
**using** *assms* **by** (*intro Mason-Stothers*) (*auto simp: degree-power-eq gcd-exp*)  
**hence**  $\text{Max}\{\text{degree}(A^n), \text{degree}(B^n), \text{degree}(C^n)\} + 1 \leq ?d$  **by**  
*linarith*  
**hence**  $n * \text{degree } A + 1 \leq ?d\ n * \text{degree } B + 1 \leq ?d\ n * \text{degree } C + 1 \leq ?d$   
**using** *assms* **by** (*simp-all add: degree-power-eq*)  
**hence**  $n * (\text{degree } A + \text{degree } B + \text{degree } C) + 3 \leq 3 * ?d$   
**unfolding** *ring-distrib* **by** *linarith*  
**also have**  $A^n * B^n * C^n = (A * B * C)^n$  **by** (*simp add: mult-ac*  
*power-mult-distrib*)  
**also have**  $\text{radical} \dots = \text{radical}(A * B * C)$   
**using**  $\langle n > 2 \rangle$  **by** *simp*  
**also have**  $\text{degree}(\text{radical}(A * B * C)) \leq \text{degree}(A * B * C)$   
**using** *nz* **by** (*intro dvd-imp-degree-le*) *auto*  
**also have**  $\dots = \text{degree } A + \text{degree } B + \text{degree } C$   
**using** *nz* **by** (*simp add: degree-mult-eq*)  
**finally have**  $(3 - n) * (\text{degree } A + \text{degree } B + \text{degree } C) \geq 3$   
**by** (*simp add: algebra-simps*)  
**hence**  $3 - n \neq 0$  **by** (*intro notI*) *auto*  
**hence**  $n < 3$  **by** *simp*  
**with**  $\langle n > 2 \rangle$  **show** *False* **by** *simp*  
**qed**

**corollary** *fermat-poly-char-0*:

**fixes**  $A\ B\ C :: 'a :: \{\text{field-gcd}, \text{field-char-0}\} \text{ poly}$   
**assumes**  $\text{sum}: A^n + B^n + C^n = 0$  **and**  $\text{cop}: \text{Gcd}\{A, B, C\} = 1$   
**assumes**  $\text{nz}: A \neq 0\ B \neq 0\ C \neq 0$  **and**  $\text{deg}: \exists p \in \{A, B, C\}. \text{degree } p > 0$   
**shows**  $n \leq 2$   
**proof** (*rule ccontr*)  
**assume**  $*: \neg(n \leq 2)$   
**with** *nz* **and** *deg* **have**  $\exists p \in \{A, B, C\}. \text{pderiv}(p^n) \neq 0$   
**by** (*auto simp: pderiv-eq-0-iff degree-power-eq*)  
**from** *fermat-poly* [*OF assms* (1-5) *this*] **and**  $*$  **show** *False* **by** *simp*  
**qed**

**end**

## References

- [1] F. Lemmermeyer. Algebraic Geometry (lecture notes). <http://www.fen.bilkent.edu.tr/~franz/ag05/ag-02.pdf>, 2005.
- [2] N. Snyder. An alternate proof of Mason's theorem. *Elemente der Mathematik*, 55(3):93–94, Aug 2000.